DEALING WITH THE UNKNOWN:

Leading in uncertain times by rethinking the design of management accounting and reporting systems.
KEY ASSUMPTIONS & FINDINGS

1. In a complex world, uncertainty is an intrinsic and irreducible feature of any decision.

2. Trying to eliminate or reduce this uncertainty can be counterproductive as it makes managers focus only on what can be measured, thus creating blind spots when making decisions.

3. We need to rethink management accounting and reporting systems to make sure accounting figures help to raise the right questions about what cannot be measured rather than providing reassuring but faulty or irrelevant numerical answers.

4. Management accounting should force the exercise of judgment and scrutiny by generating debate and productive tensions around doubt rather than alignment and shared fallacies around certainty.

5. Management accountants can regain the centre stage in organizational contexts if they mediate tensions, facilitate debate and generate innovative solutions when dealing with complex-decision making. This can be achieved through the appropriate design of management reports and processes which thus return to be central in governing organizations.

6. We propose new principles to build management accounting systems that achieve this goal.

7. We label as a ‘maieutic machine’ any management accounting and reporting system that works as (1) a visual space for interaction; (2) a method of ordering and scrutiny; (3) a platform of mediation; and (4) a motivating ritual of engagement.
INTRODUCTION

What would help you and your organization to navigate a complex and uncertain world? What does it mean to make good decisions, given the constant lack of information that contributes to the complexities of markets, economy and society at large?

A conventional answer to these questions would be a call for greater amounts of data. The more data, the better. However, there is no data that can make ‘unknown unknowns’ known and when measuring non-financial performance one encounters the same (if not bigger) complexities than are faced when measuring financial values. Believing that more data will automatically lead to better decision-making is unrealistic.

Given that uncertainty cannot be reduced, in order to deal with it we propose instead that it be embraced. This implies a different relationship with accounting data and its role in aiding decision-making.

Our research suggests that neither increasing the quantity of information or enlarging the range of metrics (financial and non-financial) leads to better decision making. It suggests instead that management accounting information and management accounting processes to stimulate opportunities should facilitate such visualizations.

1. **Visual space for interaction.** Visualizations are key as they shape how users understand, perceive and connect to organizational challenges and build a companies’ history and strategic vision of the future. Management accounting reports should facilitate such visualizations.

2. **Method of ordering and scrutiny.** To deal with problems of uncertainty, organizations require defined toolkits and methods that order complexity and create opportunities for debate and tensions to scrutinize and interrogate ‘unknown unknowns’.

3. **Platform of mediation.** Situations of uncertainty and complexity require management accounting tools that facilitate mediation between different users, conflicting interests and views, that manage interfaces with other organizational systems and that leverage the incompleteness and ambiguity of the representations they provide.

4. **Motivating rituals of engagement.** It is important that organizations ritualize and broaden participation in management accounting processes to stimulate opportunities for questioning, generate productive tensions amongst representatives from different business functions, raise doubts and stimulate engagement and motivation.

We label management accounting practices that incorporate these four features as a *maieutic machine*, where ‘maieutic’ is a term from Greek philosophy that indicates how knowledge emerges in a process of inquiry that is guided by the formulation of the right questions along some key defined procedures of questioning. In this report we provide practical guidelines and examples from management accounting reports and practices. These four features reconceive a management accounting report as a...

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

Between 2012 and 2014 we visited the head offices and divisions of 13 large, medium and small companies based in Europe, the US and the Middle East. From these organizations we selected seven case studies most suitable to developing our design principles.

Using semi-structured interviews, we explored the contributions of management accounting, reporting practices and performance measurement systems in processes of innovation and change within these organizations. A list of the selected case studies is provided below:

- **Boehringer Ingelheim** is a leading pharmaceutical group. With its headquarters in Ingelheim, Germany, it operates globally with 142 affiliates and more than 47,400 employees.
- **Eni** is a major integrated energy company, operating in Milan, Italy, it employs more than 82,000 people worldwide and operates in approximately 85 countries.
- **GE** is a leading diversified technology, media and financial services global company. From its headquarters in Fairfield (US), GE operates in more than 160 countries and employs more than 300,000 people worldwide. The oil & gas group (GE Oil & Gas) of GE is part of GE Energy – one of the major GE businesses.
- **ITSel** is a start-up Research & Development (R&D) company operating in the healthcare and IT sectors.
- **UK-Con** and the construction of the National Laboratories (NL). In December 1991, the UK Department of Trade and Industry decided to upgrade the NL buildings and facilities. UK-Con was one of the partners in the construction of the new NL.
- **MEGOC** is a large Middle East-based corporation in the oil & gas industry. It has over 55,000 employees and approximately 60,000 outside contractors, organized into seven major divisions.
- **Monnalisa** is a medium-sized company located in Arezzo, Italy, which operates in the fashion industry. Founded in 1968, Monnalisa designs and sells garments and accessories for children and is a pioneer in implementing Integrated Reporting.
**KEY OBSERVATIONS**

Maietic machines: four features that help to raise the right questions

Evidence collected from our cases studies indicates that there are four key features that can allow management accounting and reporting practices to become maietic machines, that is, effective tools for enabling managers to ask the right questions and search for solutions.

**FIGURE 1. THE FOUR FEATURES OF MAIEUTIC MACHINES**

### VISUAL SPACE OF INTERACTION
- Understand, perceive and connect to corporate challenges/goals
- Build visions of the past, present and future
- Envisage paths toward solutions

### PLATFORM OF MEDIATION
- Give rise to the diversity of users’ opinions
- Shape the dialogue with order systems
- Profit from ambiguity and incomplete of information

### METHOD OF ORDERING AND SCRUTINY
- Define toolkits and methods to order complexity
- Create opportunities for debate and tensions
- Scrutinise ‘unknown unknowns’

### RITUAL OF ENGAGEMENT
- Ritualize participation in reporting processes
- Create opportunities for questioning and raising doubt
- Strengthening of motivation

1. MANAGEMENT ACCOUNTING REPORTS AS A VISUAL SPACE FOR INTERACTION
- Understand, perceive and connect to corporate challenges/goals
- Build visions of the past, present and future
- Envisage paths toward solutions

Innovative responses to corporate challenges require management accounting and reporting practices to help envision corporate challenges/goals, the space for engagement and the possible paths toward solutions. The role of these visualizations is important because they shape how users perceive, understand and relate to organizational challenges and/or goals.

Strategy maps and balanced scorecards provide good examples of the visual power of management accounting and reporting practices. Figure 2 illustrates the way in which processes of value creation and organizational integration were visualized at MEGOC.

**FIGURE 2 – THE HORIZONTAL AXES OF THE STRATEGY MAP IN MEGOC (BUSCO AND QUATTRONE, 2015)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Increase Revenue</th>
<th>Transform Corporate Performance</th>
<th>Optimize Corporate Portfolio</th>
<th>Promote National Economy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Financial</strong></td>
<td>Improve the bottom line</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Customer</strong></td>
<td>Partner for results</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Internal</strong></td>
<td>Do it right the first time</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Learning and growth</strong></td>
<td>Improve the bottom line</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Preparing Workforce</strong></td>
<td>for the future</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2. MANAGEMENT ACCOUNTING REPORTS AS METHOD OF ORDERING AND SCRUTINY
- Define toolkits and methods that order complexity
- Create opportunities for debate and tensions
- Scrutinize and interrogate ‘unknown unknowns’

Management accounting and reporting tools need to constitute a method for ordering the complexities management faces and provide a means for scrutinizing unknown unknowns in innovative ways when responding to corporate challenges.

At Monnalisa, for example, the research, design and development process of the collection is extremely iterative. Fabrics, accessories and patterns are constantly reassessed in light of new information generated throughout the various phases of the process or collected from other internal and external sources.

Notably, as the creative process unfolds, the Design Department constantly interacts with Sales and Marketing, Production, and Finance, which in turn participate in the development of the collection by monitoring the impact of what is being developed on the company’s operations and performance.

The main financial tool used to support the creation of the collection and monitor its overall development is the Provisional Budget (see Figure 3).
During the prototyping phase, a significant number of discussions are centred on trade-offs between the aesthetic aspirations of the stylists, the cost of finalizing a garment, the complexity of production, the ethical concerns, as well as the promises made by sales managers to agents and clients. The Provisional Budget offers inputs and opportunities for conversation and confrontation as the collection develops. “It is like a magnet; it is a tool that attracts everybody’s attention”, claims a member of the Sales and Marketing Department.

Within the collection ritual, accounting and performance measurement tools such as the Provisional Budget, the related Balanced Scorecard and Cost Cards are used. The Provisional Budget represents both a method of ordering and a material grid of empty cells. It is a method because it offers a way to ‘figure out’ what topics to discuss when creating sustainable collections. It is also a material grid of empty cells, which enables the multiple and diverse parties involved to identify their topics (it is not by chance that ‘topics’ come from ancient Greek, topos, i.e. ‘space’) and generate knowledge about their view of the ideal sustainable collection, despite not yet knowing what it might actually be. The cells of the material grid are populated by categories such as the number and type of units to be produced, the variable costs for fabric and accessories, the costs associated with the internal and external production phases, as well as the budgeted gross sales revenues, and the contribution margin by collection or by product type - which are progressively filled in as the garments materialize. Used in this way, the Provisional Budget becomes both a process and a carefully designed report which forces users to speculate about, question and search for the unknown. Which in the case of Monnalisa is the sustainable collection and the perfect garment.

3. MANAGEMENT ACCOUNTING REPORTS AS PLATFORMS OF MEDIATION

• Build on the diversity of users’ opinions
• Ensure the interplays with other systems
• Profit from the ambiguity and incompleteness of information

The complex nature of the challenges facing contemporary corporations requires management accounting and reporting tools which can mediate between different users, manage the interplays with other organizational systems, and leverage the incompleteness of the representations they provide.

For example, within MEGOC the deployment of the balanced scorecard and the associated strategy maps relied on a number of means of communication, ranging from technology-driven ERP systems (SAP in this case) to the formal budgetary system, internal newsletters and an informal Café Process. The Café Process is a technique for fostering collaborative dialogue within large groups. This process creates focused networks of conversation around critical questions and the ability of small groups to focus on, think together, and come up with creative possibilities and collective action. In 2003, over 900 employees came together inside an airport hangar to have wide-ranging conversations about the future direction of MEGOC. These conversations were mediated by the strategic imperatives, objectives and measures included in the balanced scorecard.

Within MEGOC, the Café was not intended to convey an objective or unchangeable message. It was, instead, a way for participants with different views and interests to develop and rearrange relationships between texts (the six strategic imperatives and the four perspectives of the balanced scorecard) and images (the normal visual design of the balanced scorecard with the corporate strategy at its core and various scorecards surrounding it), and ultimately to identify performance measures. The incompleteness of representation offered by balanced scorecards informed a process of reflection on, and exploration of, the best way to address corporate challenges and goals. The strategy maps and the balanced scorecard were at the centre of the process. However, how best to pursue the organization’s objectives was left to the users.

4. MANAGEMENT ACCOUNTING REPORTS AS RITUALS OF ENGAGEMENT

• Ritualize participation
• Create opportunity for questioning and raising doubts
• Strengthening of motivation

For management accounting and reporting tools to be sustained over time, they need to be repeatedly practised. This means that participation in the practice, opportunities for questions and answer and strengthening of managers’ motivation need to become a regular practice – a ‘ritual’. By performing rituals, participants can both imagine and engage with practical solutions.

Figure 4 sketches the architecture of the new management systems in MEGOC. In this system, the balanced scorecard provides the link between the corporate mission and strategic imperatives on the one hand, and budgets, resource allocation and initiatives on the other. The architecture includes a cycle of recurrent training, meetings and review sessions. Together these various meetings, sessions, etc. provide numerous opportunities for discussions between managers. They provide the rituals through which the use of the balanced scorecard can create an environment in which issues can be identified, questions raised and solutions identified.
on whether to invest or not on the Airbus A3804, most of our representing financial transactions and other dimensions of the machina, which is used in rhetoric to refer to the construction of While the word machine comes from the Latin ritual of engagement) comprise what we call a ‘maieutic In the old Jesuit colleges, for example5, cash boxes had two keys to promote such symmetry and mediate tensions. Accounting figures can instead help to scrutinise this uncertainty by prompting discussions instilled by doubt rather than making that’s at fault. Design divisions, create tensions and mediate them by building on symmetry Businesses are usually divided into different areas, units, functions, etc. These ‘divisions’ can create tensions. Although these foster creative problem-solving and innovation, they must be mediated to ensure that power is distributed evenly. Management accounting and reporting practices should therefore be designed to promote such symmetry and mediate tensions. For example, GE uses Six-Sigma as it enables managers to address tensions between different performance dimensions, such as quality, process improvement and financial performance. HOW TO DESIGN A MAIEUTIC MACHINE? Instilling doubt and the role of financial allowances Rather than expecting accounting numbers to tell us the ‘truth’, accounting and reporting systems should be designed in such a way as to invite scrutiny. Ticking boxes, meeting targets, and taking numbers at face value when making business decisions can lead to disaster.

UK-Con failed to deliver temperature-controlled rooms for the new National Physics laboratory because they trusted their mathematical models and their past experiences too much and there was no system in place to ensure debate about their ability to meet the stringent specifications for temperature and noise levels within the laboratories and thus the over all feasibility of the project. The former CEO of UK-Con commented that “You would have thought someone would have asked the question ‘can we do this? Could it work?’ He went on to say: “It didn’t get asked. It was kind of arrogant [...]. Our problem was: we are [UK-Con], we can do anything!”

Accounting figures must prompt managers to tackle challenges head-on and prudently. The bottom line needs to be replaced with, or at least thought of, as a financial allowance, that is, as a number in a state of flux which could potentially fluctuate within a range. What this range is and how to position the financial situation of a project or an organization in this range is subject to matters that financial numbers cannot represent. Those are all those that create risk and uncertainty.

Accounting figures can instead help to scrutinise this uncertainty by prompting discussions instilled by doubt rather than making people seek for reassuring certainties. We should stop blaming complexity for failure and realize it’s our search for certainty that’s at fault.

Design divisions, create tensions and mediate them by building on symmetry Businesses are usually divided into different areas, units, functions, etc. These ‘divisions’ can create tensions. Although these foster creative problem-solving and innovation, they must be mediated to ensure that power is distributed evenly. Management accounting and reporting practices should therefore be designed to promote such symmetry and mediate tensions. For example, GE uses Six-Sigma as it enables managers to address tensions between different performance dimensions, such as quality, process improvement and financial performance. HOW TO DESIGN A MAIEUTIC MACHINE? Instilling doubt and the role of financial allowances Rather than expecting accounting numbers to tell us the ‘truth’, accounting and reporting systems should be designed in such a way as to invite scrutiny. Ticking boxes, meeting targets, and taking numbers at face value when making business decisions can lead to disaster.

UK-Con failed to deliver temperature-controlled rooms for the new National Physics laboratory because they trusted their mathematical models and their past experiences too much and there was no system in place to ensure debate about their ability to meet the stringent specifications for temperature and noise levels within the laboratories and thus the over all feasibility of the project. The former CEO of UK-Con commented that “You would have thought someone would have asked the question ‘can we do this? Could it work?’ He went on to say: “It didn’t get asked. It was kind of arrogant [...]. Our problem was: we are [UK-Con], we can do anything!”

Accounting figures must prompt managers to tackle challenges head-on and prudently. The bottom line needs to be replaced with, or at least thought of, as a financial allowance, that is, as a number in a state of flux which could potentially fluctuate within a range. What this range is and how to position the financial situation of a project or an organization in this range is subject to matters that financial numbers cannot represent. Those are all those that create risk and uncertainty.

Accounting figures can instead help to scrutinise this uncertainty by prompting discussions instilled by doubt rather than making people seek for reassuring certainties. We should stop blaming complexity for failure and realize it’s our search for certainty that’s at fault.

Design divisions, create tensions and mediate them by building on symmetry Businesses are usually divided into different areas, units, functions, etc. These ‘divisions’ can create tensions. Although these foster creative problem-solving and innovation, they must be mediated to ensure that power is distributed evenly. Management accounting and reporting practices should therefore be designed to promote such symmetry and mediate tensions. For example, GE uses Six-Sigma as it enables managers to address tensions between different performance dimensions, such as quality, process improvement and financial performance.
Defining tangible opportunities for engagement: temporality, rhythm and motivating paths

Eni’s planning processes comprise a recurrent succession of phases of different duration and are marked by various moments of discussion and interrogation. At the beginning of every planning cycle, all of the company’s functions are required to identify areas for improvement and new objectives for the future four-year plan. This process is based on an analysis of the external context, the evolution of sustainability internationally, a consideration of stakeholders’ expectations and the outputs of integrated risk assessment and related mitigation plans (see Figure 6). At the end of this preliminary process, Eni’s CEO issues specific operational and economic guidelines for sustainability. Issues are therefore addressed regularly and thoroughly.

WHAT CAN WE GAIN FROM MAIEUTIC MACHINE?

What is the purpose of a maieutic machine? What actions does it aim to prompt and what benefits can it generate for organizational dynamics and stakeholder management?

WISDOM AND BALANCE

Tensions between competing categories (such as between different dimensions of performance) can be mediated by searching for a ‘wise balance’ between them using diverse management and accounting tools.

For example, within ITSol, the business plan is used to manage the financial performance of its products (to meet the expectations of existing and potential investors).

Simultaneously, agile practices (and particularly Scrum methods) are used to promote technological innovation in ITSol’s social products to improve their outcomes for customers and other beneficiaries (i.e. healthcare institutions, patients and their families).
MEMORY BUILDING AND STORYTELLING

Within ITSol, a bespoke agile-based control system is used as a project management technique to translate customers’ stories (about their needs, experiences and problems) into a list of project requirements and targets. Project team members translate customers’ stories into causal maps. This translation enables team members to address customers’ problems. Their solutions are then translated into formalised reports like ‘product backlogs’ and ‘sprint backlogs’.

Management accounting and reporting tools can also help memory building, not only regarding the decisions taken (such as decisions about products and tasks recorded in the product backlog and the sprint backlog of ITSol) but also about the rationale for these decisions.

CONSIDERATION OF THE PROCESS NOT THE OUTCOME

In the past, the process of producing an income statement was more important than the actual results, where as today we tend to look at an income statement for the results it produces. Such reports are expected to (re)produce the ‘truth’, or at least get close to it, but it is the process of producing the numbers in an income statement that is most useful in inviting scrutiny and analysis.

For example, Integrated Reporting is not about ‘truthfully’ measuring sustainability but is instead about a process of questioning and interrogation, which the design of the integrated report facilitates.

RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONCLUSIONS

Informed by current debates on reporting practices, project management and performance measurement systems, as well as on studies in rhetoric and design thinking, together with the insights provided by a series of case studies, this research makes the following main recommendations:

Management accounting and reporting practices should:

1. Not be expected to work as ‘answer machines’ that produce ‘objective’ data on what course of action to pursue but rather make sure users raise the right questions to be debated when facing complex situations. Management accounting and reporting practices should instead be thought of as a visual space for interaction that helps managers to define, understand, perceive and connect to organizational challenges in order to be able to always be in tune and anticipate uncertain and volatile environments and construct markets for product and services.

2. Offer robust methods and procedures for ordering complexity to scrutinize unknowns and make decision-makers exercise judgment, given that in a complex world data are always ambiguous, incomplete, and often outdated.

3. Build on the inherent ambiguities that accounting numbers generate in order to create, and then mediate, fruitful tensions among different organizational functions and business stakeholders.

4. Return to being a cross-functional means of users’ engagement and motivation by forcing different stakeholders to take part in decision-making processes to overcome the silos mentality which has relegated the finance function to a mere provider of information rather than an active player in such processes.

We propose to re-conceive of management accounting and reporting as a ‘maieutic machine’ composed of four features (visual space for interaction; method of ordering and scrutiny, platforms of mediation, rituals of engagement), that accountants should design and then drive and provided insights on how and why to design such machine.

In order for management accountants to again become key orchestrators in decision making processes they will have to become skilled in various matters that range from design to negotiation and cultural mediation skills.

If rethought as we propose, management accounting, management accountants and management accounting reports could regain their relevance and centrality in decision-making processes.

Nowadays accounting is supposed to provide data for decision-making but other managers are not involved in the production of this data and its validity. The result is that accounting data has lost its relevance and significance (again). By making reporting processes central to the preparation of accounting data for decision-making and by considering reports as platforms of mediation amongst different stakeholders, management accountants can regain the central stage in organizations by designing and operating these platforms for value creation.
FOOTNOTES

1 TSol is not the Company’s real name.
2 UK-Con is not the Company’s real name.
3 MEGOC (Middle East Gas and Oil Company) is not the Company’s real name.

5 See Quattrone (2015)

6 Agile methodologies are project management practices, which are widely used to manage software development projects (www.agilealliance.org) as well as other projects which require a high level of customisation. ‘Scrum’ is one of the most well-known agile practices. Within ITSol, all projects utilise Scrum methods (www.scrumalliance.com).

REFERENCES AND FURTHER READING


ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This report is one of the outcomes of a research project funded by CIMA and conducted by a team of researchers in the years 2012–2014. The authors acknowledge the contribution provided by François-Régis Puyou from Audencia Nantes Management School (France) for the suggestions offered on the research design. Also, the authors would like to thank all the contributors from the organizations studied.

DISCLAIMER

The views and opinions presented in this report are those of the individual authors and do not necessarily reflect or express those of CIMA, the publisher and sponsor of the report.

AUTHORS

Paolo Quattrone
Dean of Special Projects, College of Arts, Humanities & Social Sciences
Chair in Accounting, Governance and Social Innovation
Co-Director, Centre for Accounting and Society
University of Edinburgh Business School
29 Buccleuch Place, Edinburgh EH8 9JS, Room 2.38
T +44 (0)131 651 5541
E paolo.quattrone@ed.ac.uk

Cristiano Busco
Professor of Accounting and Integrated Reporting
University of Roehampton Business School
80 Roehampton Lane
SW15 5SL London UK
T +44 020 8392 3454
E cristiano.busco@roehampton.ac.uk

Robert W Scapens
Emeritus Professor
Alliance Manchester Business School
Booth Street East
Manchester, M13 9SS, UK
T 0161 275 4020
E robert.scapens@manchester.ac.uk

Elena Giovannoni
Senior Lecturer
Royal Holloway
University of London - School of Management
Egham, Surrey, TW20 0EX, UK
T 01784443447
E elena.giovannoni@royalholloway.ac.uk
NOTES